

Emily Dickinson's Religious Poem: "Some Keep the Sabbath going to Church-"

YUMIKO SAKATA KOIZUMI

Dorothy Huff Oberhause's response to an essay by Craig Raine that discusses the religion of Emily Dickinson¹ demonstrates two diametrically opposed views on Emily Dickinson and religion. Craig Raine in his commentary on Ted Hughes's reading of Dickinson being interested in the divine, accuses Hughes of "misreading" Dickinson's poems. Raine insists that Dickinson was not a Christian but an "atheist." Oberhause argues that Raine is not right to say that Dickinson was an "atheist," and she points out that his argument is based on a total misreading of the Dickinson code, "an Eclipse." Furthermore, Oberhause criticizes the critic's tendency to quote a single sentence as evidence of his judgment on this issue.

The question of whether Emily Dickinson was a Christian or an atheist has been debated since the 1930s when Dickinson criticism had started among representative scholars. For example, Allen Tate tried to place Dickinson somewhere between Hawthorne and Emerson.² On the other hand, Yvor Winters concluded that "Emily Dickinson was a product of the New England tradition of moral Calvinism."³ In the 1960s, two major critics, Roy Harvey Pearce and Hyatt H. Waggoner, placed Dickinson in the Emersonian tradition of American poetry.⁴ However Albert Gelpi was the first Dickinson scholar who laid special emphasis on an Emersonian influence in reading Dickinson's life and work.⁵ But in 1993, Elisa New argued that Dickinson was definitely not an Emersonian but belonged to the 17th century devotional lyric tradition.⁶ Among Dickinson biographers, Alfred Habegger was the first biographer who recognized the significance of reading Dickinson in the religious context of the 1850s: "One of the biggest mistakes we make with Dickinson is to detach her from the religious currents of the 1850s, without which she could not have become herself."⁷

Jane Donahue Eberwein's call for "the way to reach insight" is "to look for long-term patterns in her religious references."⁸ Following Eberwein's instruction, I would like to focus on the issue of prayer in this paper to search for Dickinson's "long-term patterns" in her references to prayer. "Prayer" does not sound like the right word to decipher Emily Dickinson's life and work because Emily refused to make a public confession of faith that would admit her to the Church. Yet "Prayer" holds the key to unlock the spiritual world of Emily Dickinson.

"Some keep the Sabbath going to Church -" (Fr 236) has been generally discussed as one of Dickinson's representative poems to show the poet's rebellion against the First Church at Amherst, with its orthodox dogmatic beliefs. For example, Sally Burke defines the poem as typical of Dickinson's religious non-conformity: the poem "illustrates her discomfort with formal religion."⁹ In "Recycling Language: Emily Dickinson's Religious Wordplay," Linda Munk contrasts two settings to reveal the poet's intention behind the juxtaposition: "The elevated tone of a religious sermon is undercut by bird songs ...and by puns; both serve to undo the decorum of orthodoxy."¹⁰ On the other hand, some critics regard this poem as religious. For example, Beth Maclay Doriani in *Emily Dickinson, Daughter of Prophecy* elaborates the point:

Staying at home within the natural order of an orchard can result in an encounter with the divine, the speaker suggests, an encounter that is never boring or uncomfortable.¹¹

John Delli Carpini acknowledges that "Emily sought a vision of God that the Congregational church could not provide," yet he reads the second line as "not the way her ancestors kept it,

but uniquely and personally, and in her own idiosyncratic style.”¹² These diverse interpretations illuminate the extremely complicated relationship between Emily Dickinson and religion. A close reading of “Some keep the Sabbath going to Church - ” provides a vital clue for explaining the reason why there are various interpretations.

“Some keep the Sabbath going to Church - ” is one of the four poems enclosed in her letter to T. W. Higginson on July, 1862. There are three variants. According to R. W. Franklin, “a word in line 11 differs from the extant holographs”; “going” is replaced by “getting” so that a subtle nuance could be delivered in the final version. A change in line 11 in the final version conveys a hidden nuance behind the word.

The contrast between the traditional way of praying to God at church and her unique way in an orchard runs persistently all through the poem. The juxtaposition of the two landscapes effectively conveys the virtues of prayer:

Some keep the Sabbath going to Church –
I keep it, staying at Home –
With a Bobolink for a Chorister –
And an Orchard, for a Dome –

Some keep the Sabbath in Surplice –
I, just wear my Wings –
And instead of tolling the Bell, for Church,
Our little Sexton – sings.

God preaches, a noted Clergyman –
And the sermon is never long,
So instead of getting to Heaven, at last –
I’m going, all along.

There is the pattern of doubleness in the opening stanza as Linda Munk suggests: “Some go to Church, the poet stays Home. Her Chorister is a North American songbird..., the choristers in the Church are probably singing Isaac Watts.”¹³ Instead of wearing in “Surplice,” the speaker wears her “Wings.” She listens to “Our little Sexton” singing. Instead of listening to a long-winded sermon of a clergyman at church, she enjoys listening to an elevating sermon by “a Bobolink.” As a result, “I’m going, all along,” declares the speaker.

Although the poet shows contrasting ways of keeping the Sabbath, she still acknowledges that she keeps it in her own way. The speaker displays another variation of praying to God, nevertheless, she does not deny the sacred day. The line “I keep it, staying at Home-” is the key line in the poem. Just because the speaker does not go to church to pray, that does not mean that she is abandoning her faith. She does not go to church, nor wear a “Surplice,” yet she keeps the Sabbath. She prays differently from the way it is usually done. We can almost say that the speaker simply follows the advice given in the Gospel of Matthew: “But when you pray, go to your room, close the door, and pray to your Father, who is unseen” (Matt. 6. 6).

Dickinson’s employment of commas in this poem stands in stark contrast to the first two stanzas. Look closely at each arrangement of the commas:

I keep it, staying at Home –
I, just wear my Wings –

I'm going, all along.

"I" is separated from "some" by a comma, therefore, the parallelism functions as an antithesis. A comma is placed before the phrase "at Home." The comma thus inserted works like a short pause to separate things in a list or parts of a sentence while a dash in this poem helps each word to make a bridge. Dickinson's employment of commas illustrates the poet's intention of separating units of meaning in the list of doing things on the Sabbath. It exhibits a striking contrast to the normal accepted way of praying to God. It is the contrast of "Church" and "an Orchard" that makes this poem so effective in conveying the speaker's isolation.

Dickinson's deliberate use of a different verb "getting" in line 11 instead of "going" in the final version is suggestive in illustrating her attitude toward orthodox religion. The poet's intention of placing the two different verbs contrastively is clear, though both "getting" and "going" mean "to reach a particular place," probably heaven. Yet, ironically "going" is associated with the image of "going to Church," finally "going" to heaven, while "getting" has no direct association with the solemn image of attending church regularly. Technically, "getting to church" brings people to heaven. The last line, however, corresponds to the first line "Some keep the Sabbath going to Church -," though the destination is intentionally omitted in the last line, it is implied, of course, heaven. It suggests the process of going deliberately.

Both line 7 and line 12 are ambiguous in meaning. Linda Munk elucidates the double meaning as follows: "In the seventh line of Dickinson's poem, 'tolling the Bell, for Church,' has its own double signification: does the bell toll to mark the death of the Church or to summon worshippers to Church?"¹⁴ "Neither" answers the critic. Munk concludes that the question may reflect Dickinson's ambiguous attitude toward religion.

The last line is the most important for the poet to deliver what she really means. The last line "I'm going, all along" could be interpreted two ways. Dickinson's employment of a comma after each key word delineates a more subtle meaning in each line. The contrast between "at last -" and "all along" clearly shows a different state of being. Beth Maclay Doriani points out that "At last -" focuses on "a single moment" while "all along" suggests "ongoing, a state of being."¹⁵ The place where the dash is replaced by a comma in the final version represents the poet's consciousness of separating one line into two units. The clear distinction makes a striking contrast between "going to Church -" and "staying at Home"; "Some" and "I"; "getting to Heaven" and "going." John Delli Carpini elucidates the difference between the last two lines:

Emily was almost always open to God's mystery. Consequently, she did not desire to *get to heaven*, so much as to *go to heaven* each day. In fact, when Emily sat in her garden, she believed that she *was* in heaven. There she spoke to God and God spoke to her, "I" to "Thou" and "Thou" to "I." In ordinary daily events and the created world she observed each day, she encountered the infinite.¹⁶

The speaker does not desire to get to heaven, yet wishes to go in her idiosyncratic way.

What does "going to Church" mean for Emily? Hyatt H. Waggoner states that "to be 'religious' in this village society was to experience a conviction of salvation, to become an active member of the church, and to profess publicly faith in its dogmas."¹⁷ To be called a "religious" person, she had to become "an active member of the church." Reading Dickinson's biographies helps us to comprehend the reason why the poet stopped attending Church regularly. In 1847-48, Dickinson was educated at the Mount Holyoke Female Seminary where she was asked to make a public confession of faith that would admit her to the First Church. Dickinson commented on that experience rather bluntly: "They thought it queer, I didn't rise"; "I thought

a lie would be queerer.”¹⁸

Mary Lyon, the president of the school, at the Mount Holyoke Seminary divided the student body into three groups: “Christians,” “Hopers” and “No-Hopers.” Those who had accepted Christ; those who expressed the hope of accepting Christ; and those who refused Christ. Young Emily belonged to “No-Hopers,” though she regretted it later in her life. According to Polly Longworth, “The education most New England youth received during that era was profoundly Christian, that is, Calvinist and fundamentalist. In 1847-48, Dickinson attended Mount Holyoke Female Seminary, where Mary Lyon did her utmost to draw her students into the Christian fold.”¹⁹

Taking the cultural background of staunch moral Puritanism into consideration, the fact is that Dickinson refused to make the public confession of faith because she thought it queer to lie, and as a result, she left off attending services at the Church by age thirty. Placing Dickinson in the cultural context of the 1850s, we read her poems differently. Alfred Habegger gives us a warning that “one of the biggest mistakes we make with Dickinson is to detach her from the religious currents of the 1850s, without which she could not have become herself.”²⁰ Dickinson would not compromise herself by doing something to which she could not find any solid evidence. But she was not conscious of refusing Christ.

Dickinson’s inclination to listen to “the anthems” in nature seen through this poem is evident in her letters:

I do wish I could tell you just how the Robins sing – they don’t sing now...but they did sing, this morning, for when we were going to church, they filled the air with such melody, and sang deliciously, that...I never should get to meeting. (L 86)

It is Sunday – now – John – and all have gone to church – the wagons have done passing, and I have come out in the new grass to listen to the anthems. (L 184)

We find here the same current of the English romantic poets and the American Transcendentalists, a natural piety. Randall Stewart in *American Literature and Christian Doctrine* characterizes this poem: “The poem is also a part of the nature-cult (found, too, in Emerson) which regarded nature as uniformly beautiful and benign.”²¹ First he associates Dickinson with Emerson, because seemingly this romantic aspect of “the nature-cult” is found in some of Dickinson’s poems. In “Some keep the Sabbath going to Church - ,” mentions Stewart, there is an echo of Emerson’s “Divinity School Address”: “On Sundays, it seems wicked to go to church.”²² Emerson criticizes the stern religion at that time, and calls for religion for the soul. On the surface, the poet seems to be sympathetic with Emerson’s rebellious attitude toward orthodox religion. However reading another essay by Emerson, “Self-Reliance,” Emerson puzzles us especially when Emerson defines “prayer” as “a disease of the will.”²³ We can say that Dickinson is not an Emersonian, because Dickinson values prayer in the first place and furthermore, she acknowledges the presence of “God” in the third stanza. Emily Dickinson’s prayer is not “the soliloquy of a beholding and jubilant soul,”²⁴ but is the persistent attempt to communicate with the divine.

Essentially, Dickinson is closer to Anne Bradstreet than Emerson in terms of prayer. Compare the following letters:

It was my greatest pleasure to feel that he would listen to my prayers. (L11)

I have had great experience of God’s hearing my prayers and returning comfortable answers to me, either in granting the thing I prayed for, or else in satisfying my mind

without it, and I have been confident it hath been from my heart through His goodness enlarged in thankfulness to Him.²⁵ (Anne Bradstreet)

Although Dickinson's God has not answered back, the poet still believes in the power of prayer. The letter to Abiah Root ironically reveals Emily's adamant belief in prayer: "so there's small giddy life to the better, the life eternal, and be filled with this true communion, I shall not cease to pray" (L39). John Delli Carpini summarizes this prayer poem:

Although she never denied that God could speak through the medium of a clergyman, she listened for God to speak directly to her through her experience of external and human nature, and in her private prayer "God preaches, a noted Clergyman - /," she notes, "And the sermon is never long."²⁶

Yvor Winters's suggestion that the key to Hart Crane and Emily Dickinson is not Emersonian but rather through the seventeenth-century devotional lyric rings so true here. Elisa New also follows the same line of thought in *Regenerate Lyric: Theology and Innovation*:

Dickinson is less an Emersonian idealist-an American Kantian or Romantic-seeking center through pursuit of her poetic persona, than the most confirmed kind of Protestant, everywhere apprehending her own "limit," finding in each Emersonian circle of adequacy but another center to be dissolved.²⁷

Dennis Donoghue's comment on Emily Dickinson is very suggestive to show how Dickinson critics have addressed this sensitive issue, "Emily Dickinson and Religion." Donoghue suggests that "We should play the Puritan theme song very quietly when Emily Dickinson is our topic,"²⁸ because, he says, he cannot "find enough evidence to show that the Puritan traditions bore more heavily upon Emily Dickinson than the traditions of the South upon Ransom."²⁹ Quoting from Allen Tate who "has told us that Emily Dickinson had the great good fortune to write at a time when the New England Puritan doctrines had lost their first power but were still capable of dramatizing the human soul,"³⁰ Donoghue argues that the Puritan traditions function as a framework, a "myth" in Emily Dickinson's poems.

Donoghue points out one of the most remarkable characteristics of Emily Dickinson's poetry: "She took very little, in fact, from the available sources – from other poets, for instance."³¹ He ignores her frequent quotations from the Bible, he seems to imply that Dickinson's application of the hymn meter does have nothing to do with the content.

Donoghue's specific question "Is it not significant, for instance, that when God comes into Emily Dickinson's poems He is as changeable as the weather, He has no fixed image?"³² has to be examined in detail.

Twenty-eight years later, a few weeks after Dr. Holland died (Oct. 1881), Emily vividly remembers one of her enduring memories of that first September visit to the Hollands:

I shall never forget the Doctor's prayer, my first morning with you – so simple, so believing. That God must be a friend – that was a different God – and I almost felt warmer myself, in the midst of a tie so sunshiny. (L 731, 1881)

Interestingly enough, the poet reports on her impressive experience with "a different God" in Dr. Holland's prayer. Dickinson's first letter to Dr. Holland and Mrs. Holland is concerned with the ineffectiveness of prayers: "If prayers had any answers to them, you were all here to-night, but I

seek and I don't find, and knock and it is not opened" (L 133). Dickinson often uses the terms of prayer in her letters to Mrs. Holland as if they were the words coming to her naturally. God is everywhere in Dickinson's letters to Mrs. Holland.

According to Richard Sewall, Mrs. Holland was "one of Emily's closest and most trusted confidantes." Emily's relationship with Mrs. Holland was "a constant in her life for thirty-three years."³² The correspondence began in the 1850s. Emily started to write to Mrs. Holland in 1853 when Emily lost her mentor, Ben Newton who "taught me Immortality" (L 261). Benjamin Newton, "the first of my own friends," gave Emily a copy of Emerson's poems, who taught her "what to read, what authors to admire, what was most grand or beautiful in nature, and that sublime lesson, a faith in things unseen, and in a life again, nobler, and much more blessed -" (L 153). Dickinson wonders in the same letter if Benjamin Newton's God was "his Father in Heaven" or not:

He often talked of God, but I do not know certainly if he was his Father in Heaven – please sir, to tell me if he was willing to die, and if you think him at Home, I should love so much to know certainly, that he was today in Heaven. (L 153)

Dickinson's frequent quotations from the Book of Revelation signifies the poet's earlier thought about immortality. The concept was initially introduced by her first tutor, Benjamin Newton. Coincidentally, Dickinson started the correspondence with the Hollands in 1853 when Newton died. As a result, her concern about immortality seemed to have been transformed into a Christian sense of immortality.

"What drew her to religion," writes Eberwein, "was hope for immortality rather than for forgiveness."³³ The concept of immortality introduced by Benjamin Newton was associated with Mr. and Mrs. Holland who told Emily how merry and joyful was the Bible. Especially the Book of Revelation was Emily's favorite book of the Bible. The poet's search for "things, that do not fade" is manifested in her quotations and echoes of Revelation. "To live, and die, and mount again in triumphant body, and next time, try the upper air" (L 184) was the poet's everlasting concern in writing poetry. She was obsessed with trying to find a way out of mortality and to be able to gain a way to become "External." The Book of Revelation seems to be one of the few literary sources which provides Dickinson with a slight hope to reach "this promised Resurrection." The most appealing image for the poet is the verse quoted in her letter to Mrs. Holland: "where friends should 'go no more out; and there were there – not here – and that wonderful world had commenced, which makes such promises" (L 185). Reading some of the verses in the Book of Revelation, Dickinson confesses that "I'm half tempted to take my seat in that Paradise of which the good man writes, and begin forever and ever now, so wondrous does it seem" (L 185).

Emily Dickinson's letters to Mrs. Holland reveal how religious Emily is. Mrs. Holland is the key person to unlock Emily's attitude toward religion. She seems to be the only person to whom Emily has spoken of her ideas on religion including heretic ones frankly:

Don't tell, dear Mrs. Holland, but wicked as I am, I read my bible sometimes, and in it as I read today, I found a verse like this, where friends should "go no more out"; and there were "no tears," and I wished as I sat down to-night that we were there – not here – and that wonderful world had commenced, which makes such promises, and rather than to write you, I were by your side, and the "hundred and forty and four thousand" were chatting pleasantly, yet not disturbing us. (L 185)

Here Dickinson admits that she is "wicked," but she also confesses that she "read her Bible sometimes." Furthermore, she states that some verses in the Book of Revelation fascinate her. These lines of Revelation must have satisfied Emily's hunger for immortality. "Immortality" is certainly a gigantic topic for the poet to work on. The image of eternal life in the Book of Revelation makes Emily consider the possibility "to take her seat in that Paradise."

Mrs. Holland seems to be the only person to whom Emily openly could raise the taboo question concerning this theological matter. When Emily heard the typical Calvinist sermon on "perdition," she was so frightened that she could ask for help (L 175). Certain things Emily could not tell anyone except Mrs. Holland are expressed in her letters: "Austin and I were talking the other Night about the Extension of Consciousness, after Death and Mother told Vinnie, afterward, she thought it was 'very improper'" (L 650).

Some critics argue that Dickinson had lost her interest in religion after the 1850s, because there are few religious references in her letters. For example, Magdalena Zapadowska comments on Dickinson's indifference to the revival of 1858: "Dickinson's bemused and ironic comments on the revival of 1858 are already those of a distanced observer" and concludes that "some afterwards she wholly refused to attend Sabbath services, withdrawing into the tumultuous privacy of her belief just as she withdrew into the privacy of the Dickinson mansion."³⁴ There are obviously not many references to religion in her letters written in the 1860s and after, however, reading all her letters written to Mrs. Holland from 1853 to 1884 helps us confirm that her interest in religion is a life-long search for immortality. These letters help dispel the common notion that Emily was an atheist with no interest in the religious issues of her time.

Having grown up in the age of science, Dickinson was aware of the power of science to offer evidence to the unanswerable question. Nina Baym in "Emily Dickinson and Scientific Skepticism," mentions that "Dickinson characteristically trusts science over doctrine, respecting science for its willingness to define limits and stay within their logic, denigrating 'gentlemen' who keep microscopes in reserve for emergencies"³⁵ in discussing "'Faith' is a fine invention" (Fr 202). Science provided many of the truths that interested Emily, yet not all the truths. The poem appears to deny the power of "Faith," "seeing with the eyes of faith" does not work at all. But reading it closely, "Faith" and "Microscopes" are balanced equally under certain conditions, though "Microscopes" are handy in emergencies. If "gentlemen" have the capacity to see, then faith functions well, because there are certain things in this world which can be suspected only by faith. "One is a dainty sum! One bird, one cage, one flight; one song in those far woods, as yet suspected by faith only!" (L 207); the mystery of life could be the one faith would provide an answer. Dickinson never seems to give up a slight hope of entering into the kingdom of heaven, believing some room is left for her; "I'm afraid we are all unworthy, yet we shall 'enter in.'" (L 39). She never gives up praying to God all throughout her life; "We pray to Him, and He answers 'No.' Then we pray to Him to rescind the 'no,' and He don't answer at all, yet 'Seek and ye shall find' is the boon of faith" (L 830, 1883).

NOTES

1. Dorothy Huff Oberhause, TLS, 1/5/2007, Issue 5414, 15.
2. Allen Tate, "New England Culture and Emily Dickinson," *The Recognition of Emily Dickinson*, ed. by Caesar R. Blake and Carlton F. Wells (The University of Michigan Press, 1968), 156.
3. Yvor Winters, "Emily Dickinson and the Limits of Judgment," *The Recognition of Emily Dickinson*, 199.
4. Roy Harvey Pearce, *The Continuity of American Poetry* (Princeton University Press, 1961), 174-191.

- Hyatt H. Waggoner, *American Poets from the Puritans to the Present*, (Baton Rouge and London: Louisiana State University Press, 1984), 181-222.
5. Albert Gelpi, *Emily Dickinson: The Mind of the Poet* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1971).
 6. Elisa New, *Regenerate Lyric: Theology and Innovation in American Poetry* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), 151- 183.
 7. Alfred Habegger, *My Wars are Laid Away in Books* (New York: Random House, 2001), 310.
 8. Jane Donahue Eberwein, "Is Immortality True?": Salvaging Faith in an Age of Upheavals," *A Historical Guide to Emily Dickinson*, ed. Vivian R. Pollak (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2004), 70.
 9. Sally Burke, "A Religion of Poetry: The Prayer Poems of Emily Dickinson," *Emily Dickinson Bulletin*, no.33 (1st Half 1978): 17-25, 19.
 10. Linda Munk, "Recycling Language: Emily Dickinson's Religious Wordplay," *ESQ* 32 (4th Quarter 1986): 232-52, 240.
 11. Beth Maclay Doriani, *Emily Dickinson, Daughter of Prophecy*, (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1996), 65.
 12. John Delli Carpini, *Poetry as Prayer: Emily Dickinson*, (Pauline Books & Media, 2002), 65
 13. Linda Munk, "Recycling Language: Emily Dickinson's Religious Wordplay," 240.
 14. *Ibid.*
 15. Beth Maclay Doriani, *Emily Dickinson, Daughter of Prophecy*, 65-6.
 16. John Delli Carpini, *Poetry as Prayer: Emily Dickinson*, 85.
 17. Hyatt H. Waggoner, *American Poets from the Puritans to the Present*, 184.
 18. Richard Sewall, *The Life of Emily Dickinson* (Harvard University Press, 1974), 360.
 19. Ed. Polly Longworth, "And Do Not Forget Emily": Confidante Abby Wood on Dickinson's Lonely Religious Rebellion," *NEQ*, LXXXII (June 2009).
 20. Alfred Habegger, *My Wars are Laid Away in Book*, 310.
 21. Randall Stewart, *American Literature & Christian Doctrine* (Baton Rouge: Louisiana State University, 1958), 70.
 22. Ralph Waldo Emerson, "Divinity School Address," *Ralph Waldo Emerson: Essays & Lectures* (The Library of America, 1983), 87.
 23. Ralph Waldo Emerson, "Self-Reliance," *Ralph Waldo Emerson: Essays & Lectures*, 276.
 24. *Ibid.*
 25. Anne Bradstreet, *The Puritans in America: A Narrative Anthology*, ed. by Alan Heimert and Andrew Delbanco (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1985), 139-40.
 26. John Delli Carpini, *Poetry as Prayer: Emily Dickinson*, 142.
 27. Elisa New, *The Regenerate Lyric: Theology and Innovation in American Poetry*, 162.
 28. Dennis Donoghue, *Connoisseurs of Chaos: Ideas of Order In Modern American Poetry* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1984), 115.
 29. *Ibid.*
 30. *Ibid*, 114
 31. *Ibid*, 115-6.
 32. Richard Sewall, *The Life of Emily Dickinson*, 594.
 33. Jane Donahue Eberwein, "Is Immortality True?": Salvaging Faith in an Age of Upheavals," 78.
 34. Magdalena Zapadowska, "Wrestling with Silence: Emily Dickinson's Calvinist God," *The American Transcendental Quarterly*, 20.1 (March 2006), 379.
 35. Nina Baym, *American Women of Letters and the Nineteenth-Century Sciences: Styles of Affiliation* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2002), 148.